

T. Abylov^{1*} , B. Abdilkhakim¹ , H. Kurt² 

¹Egyptian University of Islamic Culture Nur-Mubarak, Kazakhstan, Almaty

²Ankara University, Turkey, Ankara

* e-mail: abylovtt@gmail.com

THE RELATIONS BETWEEN ADHERENTS OF DIFFERENT ISLAMIC MADHABS IN THE GOLDEN HORDE

The authors in the article try to determine the relationship of Islamic madhhabs in the period of the Golden Horde. Although there are many studies on the general religious situation and the process of Islamization in the Golden Horde, relationship between madhhabs should be researched carefully. Therefore, the article in detail describes the state of Islam in the Golden Horde, representatives of which madhhabs lived, which madhhab the majority of the population adhered to, and the level of religious education. Relations between religious figures and the rulers of the Golden Horde are discussed. In the course of the study, the authors find out that the Hanafi madhhab was widespread among the Muslims of the Golden Horde, they were able to create their own religious centers and received political support from the khans. The efforts of Sunni doctrinal schools such as Maturidiyah and Ashariyah to unite on the basis of common values in this era are discussed. The policy of the authorities of the Golden Horde to prevent discord and strengthen ties between Muslim madhhabs is also analyzed. The study is based on medieval historical works, travel books, biographical books describing the life and work of scientists, works written on various theological topics, as well as new scientific research related to Islamic madhhabs on the territory of the Golden Horde.

Key words: Islam, Golden Horde, Madhhab, Maturidis, relations between Madhhabs.

Т. Абылов^{1*}, Б. Абдилхаки¹, Х. Курт²

¹Нұр-Мұбарак Египет ислам мәдениеті университеті, Қазақстан, Алматы қ.

²Анкара университеті, Түркия, Анкара қ.

* e-mail: abylovtt@gmail.com

Алтын Ордадағы мұсылман мәзһабтарын ұстанушылар арасындағы қарым – қатынастар

Мақалада авторлар Алтын Орда мемлекетінде таралған исламдық мәзһабтар арасында қандай қарым-қатынастар орнағанын анықтауға тырысады. Өйткені Алтын Ордадағы жалпы діни ахуал мен исламдану үдерісі жайлы зерттеулер көп болғанымен, мәзһабаралық қарым-қатынастар жайлы зерттеулер әлі де аз. Сондықтан мақалада Алтын Ордада ислам дінінің жағдайы, қандай мәзһаб өкілдері өмір сүргені, халықтың көпшілігі қандай мәзһабты ұстанғаны, діни білім беру қандай деңгейде болғаны жан-жақты баяндалады. Алтын Ордалық дін ғалымдары мен билік иелерінің арасындағы қарым-қатынастар талқыланады. Авторлар зерттеу барысында ханафиликтің Алтын Ордадағы мұсылмандар арасында кең тараған мәзһаб болғанын, өз діни орталықтарын құра алғанын және хандардың саяси қолдауына ие болғанын анықтайды. Матуридилік және Әшғарилік сияқты сүнниттік доктриналды мектептердің осы Алтын Орда дәуірінде ортақ құндылықтар негізінде бірігуге деген талпыныстары сөз болады. Сондай-ақ Алтын Орда билігінің мұсылман мәзһабтары арасындағы алауыздықтың алдын алу үшін жүргізген саясаты мен мәзһабаралық байланыстарды нығайтудағы рөлі талданады. Зерттеу ортағасырлық тарихи шығармаларға, саяхатнамаларға, мәзһаб ғалымдарының өмірі мен еңбектері баяндалатын биография кітаптарына, түрлі теологиялық тақырыптарда жазылған еңбектерге, сондай-ақ Алтын Орда территориясындағы исламдық мәзһабтарға қатысты жасалған жаңа ғылыми зерттеулерге негізделіп отырып зерделенеді.

Түйін сөзгер: Ислам, Алтын Орда, мәзһаб, матуридилер, мәзһабаралық қарым-қатынастар.

Т. Абылов^{1*}, Б. Абдилхаким¹, Х. Курт²

¹Египетский университет исламской культуры Нур-Мубарак, Казахстан, г. Алматы

²Университет Анкара, Турция, г. Анкара

* e-mail: abylovtt@gmail.com

Взаимоотношения между последователями мусульманских мазхабов в Золотой Орде

В статье авторы пытаются определить взаимосвязь исламских мазхабов, распространенных в государстве Золотой Орды. Хотя существует много исследований об общей религиозной ситуации и процессе исламизации в Золотой Орде, исследований о взаимоотношениях между мазхабами по-прежнему мало. Поэтому в статье подробно описывается состояние ислама в Золотой Орде, представители каких мазхабов жили, какого мазхаба придерживалось большинство населения, уровень религиозного образования. Обсуждаются отношения между религиозными деятелями и правителями Золотой Орды. В ходе исследования авторы выясняют, что ханафитский мазхаб был широко распространен среди мусульман Золотой Орды, что позволило им создать свои религиозные центры и получить политическую поддержку ханов. Обсуждаются усилия объединения на основе общих ценностей суннитских доктринальных школ, таких, как Матуридия и Ашария. Также проанализирована политика властей Золотой Орды по предотвращению розни и укреплению связей между мазхабами. В основу исследования легли средневековые исторические труды, путевые записки, биографические книги, описывающие жизнь и деятельность ученых, работы, написанные на различные богословские темы, а также новые научные исследования, связанные с исламскими мазхабами на территории Золотой Орды.

Ключевые слова: Ислам, Золотая Орда, мазхаб, матуридита, взаимоотношения между мазхабами.

Introduction

The majority of the people of the Golden Horde descended from various Turkic tribes that had converted to Islam before the XX century. Only some Mongols in administrative positions refused Islam in the beginning. However, after Batu Khan's younger brother Berke Khan accepted Islam, the religion began to spread rapidly throughout the Golden Horde. Commercial and cultural relations with Central Asia developed quickly while the influence of Islam increased, especially after the establishment of the capital city of Sarai in the region where Islamic culture had spread since the 10th century. The fact that regions such as Crimea, Volga Bulgaria and Khwarezm in the Golden Horde had adopted Islamic culture undoubtedly had a great influence on the choice of Islam as the religion of the government.

Islam spread rapidly in the areas dominated by the Golden Horde, especially during the reign of the Uzbek Khan (1313-1341), and many cities, especially the capital Sarai, were decorated with mosques, madrasas and lodges, as in all Islamic countries. The monarchs and dignitaries of the state housed and protected scholars, sheikhs, *sayyids* and *hodjas* in their palaces and mansions. In addition, famous Islamic scholars were invited to the cities of the Golden Horde, where they taught religious sciences in madrasas and wrote their works. Scholars who grew up in the Golden Horde madrasas were

later recognized not only in their country but also across the entire Islamic world.

Thanks to both local and foreign religious teachers, various doctrinal and legal madhabs spread throughout the lands of the Golden Horde. In the Golden Horde territory, Maturidism and Ash'arism were dominant as doctrinal madhabs, as were Hanafi and Shafi'i as legal madhabs. At the same time, there was a minority belonging to the Mu'tazilah madhabs in regions such as Khwarezm. However, no evidence has been found in Golden Horde sources regarding the existence of other non-Sunnah madhabs.

Justification of the choice of articles and goals and objectives

Despite the focus in these studies on biography and the works of scholars and madhabs in the Golden Horde, the relations between different Islamic madhabs are not discussed at a similar length. As a result, we must draw a general picture of madhabs and their relationship to each other in the Golden Horde by carefully looking at the information mentioned in the general history, fiqh, *tabaqat* (biographical literature) and travel books of the period.

Research objectives: To review the madhabs' (schools of Islamic jurisprudence) position in the Golden Horde; to estimate the relationship between the representatives of different madhabs; as well as

to determine the policy of the khans of the Golden Horde in relation to Islamic madhabs.

Scientific research methodology

To study the topic, we comprehensively examined the religious and political structure of the Golden Horde and turned not only to historical, but also to religious and literary books and travel books. When analyzing data, it is important to be guided by the positions of historicity and objectivity. Because it not only allows you to determine the historical background of events, analyze their cause-and-effect relationships, determine the factors that contributed to social changes, but also increases the value of scientific work. If one adheres to an objective position, without resorting to a particular religious or political ideology, one can uncover the essence of the problem and evaluate its consequences and results. For this reason, scientific, logical and systematic methods were used in this study.

Main part

Hanafis

Hanafism was a widespread madhab accepted by the majority of the Muslims of the Golden Horde. The inclusion of Khwarazm in the Golden Horde was an effective factor in both the promotion of Hanafi fiqh and in the formation of its own traditions in the country. One of the characteristics of religious sciences in the Golden Horde period is the frequent use of *sharh* (interpretation) and *hashiya* (annotation). As a matter of fact, the works written in the field of fiqh in this period were primarily involved with adding interpretations, annotations and notes to the existing works or otherwise rearranging them. Jamal al-Qarshi, who lived in the city of Barchkend at the time of the Golden Horde, met with Hanafi scholar Abu Makhamid Khamid ibn 'Asim al-Asimi al-Barchinligi in 1273-1274 (Hijri year 676). Jamal al-Qarshi introduces him as a scholar in sciences such as fiqh and *tafsir* (refers to exegesis, usually of the Quran), and also as a great poet who could write Arabic, Persian and Turkish poetry. According to Jamal al-Qarshi, al-Barchinligi wrote a book belonging to al-Zamakhshari titled *Mujmal*, which summarizes *Mufassal*. In the field of fiqh, al-Barchinligi wrote *Hidayat al-Mahdi min hidayati al-Muhtadi*, which summarized the famous Hanafi scholar Burhan ad-Din al-Marginani's *Al-Hidaya fi al-Fiqh* and allowed readers to easily memorize al-Marginani's text (Al-Qarshi, 2005: 155-156).

In the same region at the beginning of 704/1304, Muhammad ibn Ayyub ibn Yusuf ibn Hasan ibn Nasr al-Jandi rewrote Al-Sadru Al-Shaheed *Umdat al-Fatawa* and Abu Hafis al-Nasafi's *Muhtaru al-Fatawa* (Muminov, 2015: 228). In 732/1332 in the city of Ozgend, Badruddin ibn Zirak al-Sulkhani investigated Nasir ad-Din al-Samarkandi's *al-Fiqh an-Nafi*, and Sayyid Jalal al-Itkani al-Otrari edited al-Afshanji's *Khakaik al-Manzuma* (Muminov, 2015: 232-233). In 751/1350-1351, Akhmad bin Mahmud al-Jandi interpreted al-Mutarrizi's *al-Misbakh* (Marjani, 1897: 85-86). Rashid ad-Din Ismail ibn Mahmud ibn Muhammed al-Kardari wrote *Mafatih al-Aqfal fi sharkhi al-faraidi al-Uthmaniyah* in 771 / 1369-1370 (Marjani, 1897: 86).

It is likely that the successful spread of Hanafi law in the Golden Horde was due to the country's tolerant approach to Turkic steppe traditions. This attitude was important in terms of the different ethnic and madhab situations within the Golden Horde community. In the 14th century, Ibn Battuta recorded that in the Golden Horde, Muslims drink *boza*, which was not permissible in other madhabs. He also suggested that this flexibility in the Golden Horde originated from Hanafi. At the same time, what Ibn Battuta saw in Khwarazm is also remarkable: he noted that *salat/namaz* (praying) was obligatory for everyone, and that those who did not perform the prayer were punished. Ibn Battuta said: "Anyone who does not pray will be punished by the imam. There is a whip hanging on the wall in every mosque in order to punish people. In addition, those who don't do namaz pay a fine of five dinars for the sake of the mosque or to feed the poor," (Ibn Battuta, 1987: 366). At the same time, in his travel book talking about the Golden Horde Muslims, Ibn Battuta observed several times that "they belong to the Hanafi madhab," emphasizing that Hanafism was a common madhab in the Golden Horde (Ibn Battuta, 1987: 332, 348).

In the 1330s, the commercial route of the Silk Road (which passed through the Iranian lands under the rule of the Ilkhanians) was closed due to the chaos in the region and began to pass through the territory of the Golden Horde. This led to the revival of the economy and the development of culture and science. Drawn by the encouragement of Golden Horde Khans, the best scholars of the period came to live in the capital city of Sarai. As a result, the city surpassed Bukhara and Samarkand as the center of Hanafism in Central Asia.

Ashirbek Muminov divided Hanafis of the Golden Horde period into two groups, based on al-

Kafawi: 1) The old Khwarazm school, which is represented by qadi Muhammad ibn Mahmud al-Tarjumani (d. 645/1247) and his son and successor Ahmed ibn Muhammad al-Tarjumani (d. 661/1262), as well as by the great scholar Najmuddin Abu al-Raja Mukhtar ibn Mahmud ibn Muhammad al-Zahidi (d. 658/1260); and 2) Hanafits which belong to the new generation, including Jalaluddin ibn Shamsuddin al-Kurlani (XIV century) and his students. Al-Kurlani received the Bukhara Hanafi tradition from Abd al-Aziz ibn Ahmad al-Bukhari and Husam al-Din al-Sygnaki and continued it (Muminov, 2015: 229).

Scholars such as Abd al-Awwal ibn Ali al-Fergani from Samarkand (d. After 813 / 1410-1411) and his relative Isam ibn Abd al-Malik al-Marginani (after 814 / 1411-1412) moved to Sarai to live and work. Thus, the faqihs of Samarkand from the Burhan ad-Din al-Marginani family became the representatives of the new Golden Horde Hanafi faqih chain. Muhammad ibn Ahmad al-Qirimi, who was a student of Abd al-Awwal ibn Ali al-Fargani in Sarai, spread that Hanafi tradition to Anatolia (Muminov, 2015: 230).

One of the students of the al-Kurlani was Muhammad ibn Shihab al-Kardari (XIV century). His son Hafizuddin Muhammed ibn Mohammed ibn Shihab al-Kardari al-Khwarazmi (d. Ramadan 827 / July-August 1424) was one of his students (Al-Lucknawi, 1324: 187-188). Another student of Jalaluddin ibn Shams ad-Din al-Kurlani was author of *Jawahir al-Fiqhi fi al-Ībadat* Tahir ibn Islam ibn Qasim ibn Ahmad al-Ansar al-Khwarazmi (d.771/ after 1370), famously known by his epithet (laqab) Sugud (Said) Nemedpush (Katip Çelebi, 2016: 517; Al-Lucknawi, 1324: 84-85).

Muhammad ibn Muhammad al-Kardari ibn al-Bazzazi lived in Sarai and Haji Tarhan, after which he relocated to Crimea and stayed there for some time while teaching in madrasas. He returned to his country after he went to Anatolia from Crimea. He had scientific debates with Molla Shamsuddin Fenari during his second trip to Anatolia and defeated him in the debates. He became famous in the Hanafi world with *al-Fatawa al-Bazzaziyya*. Among his students were Hanafi scholars such as Sharaf ad-Din ibn Kamal ad-Din al-Qirimi (15th century), Siraj ad-Din al-Qirimi al-Hajtarhani (XV century), Ahmed ibn Abdullah al-Qirimi (d.862/1457-1458) and Muhammed ibn Suleiman Kafiyaji (d. 879/1474) (Muminov, 2015: 230).

The activities of the Golden Horde Hanafis significantly influenced the spread of Hanafi madhab

to other geographic areas. For example, Ahmad ibn Abdullah al-Qirimi (known later as Ahi Çelebi), a student of scholars such as Abd al-Awwal ibn Ali al-Fargani, Hafiz ad-Din al-Kardari and Sharaf ad-Din ibn Kamal ad-Din al-Qirimi, was a teacher of Ottoman scholar Yusuf ibn Juneid al-Tokadi (Muminov, 2015: 89). Thus, the Hanafi fiqh of Khwarazm, which was revived in Sarai for a period, reached Anatolia through Crimea.

Some Hanafi scholars who were born in the Golden Horde but were well-known in Arab countries are also found in Tabaqat (biographical books). One of them is Mansur ibn Ahmed ibn Yazid Abu Muhammad al-Khwarazmi (d. 775/1373), who wrote a book in *Usul al-Fiqh* titled *Sharhu Mugni al-Habbazi*. He spent the last years of his life in Mecca (Al-Lucknawi, 1324: 215-216).

Hanafi scholar Mahmud ibn Kutlushah al-Saraii (d. 775/ 1373-1374) went to Damascus and lived there for some time. He became famous for science in Damascus, so khan of Mamluks Sargatmush (d. 1358) invited him to Cairo as a professor in a madrasa. Mahmud al-Saraii also worked in the fields of Arabic language, method, logic, philosophy and medicine as well as fiqh (Al-Maqrizi, 2002: 466; Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani, 1349:332, Ramzi, 2002: 711).

Rukn ad-Din Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Qirimi (d. 783 / 1381-1382), known by epithet Murta'ish (Shaki), was a judge in his hometown in Crimea for thirty years before he went to Egypt. He also worked as a judge while living in Cairo. He lectured in the Azhar Mosque and wrote a *sharh* (commentary) for *Sahih* of al-Bukhari in Crimea. He was criticized by some of his contemporaries due to the different views in his sharh. His main works are *Sharh al-Jami' al-Sahih li al-Bukhari* and *Majma'u al-Akhlaq wa an-Nasaih* (Al-Tamimi, 1983: II/65-66; Ramzi, 2002: 706-708).

Another Hanafi scholar is Ahmad ibn Abi Yazid ibn Muhammad al-Saraii (754/1353-791/1389), also known as Mawlana Zade. He was born in the capital of the Golden Horde to a respected, pious and generous scholar and statesman. His father became the minister of the waqf foundations in Sarai. When Mawlana Zade was nine years old, his father passed away. Mawlana Zade, who received his early education in his hometown, set out for scientific travel at the age of twenty and traveled to many countries. Later, he settled in Cairo and taught the hadith in Zahiriya and Sargatmushiya madrasas. Mawlana Zade was poisoned to death by someone jealous of his fame. Although he passed away at the early age of 36, he left behind an important scientific legacy. His

son Muhib ad-Din (791/1389-859/1455) was also a great scholar and the imam of the Mamluk sultan of the period, al-Ashraf Barsbay (Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani, 1969: 383-384; Al-Tamimi, 1983: I/316-317; Ramzi, 2002: 704.).

Another Golden Horde scholar who lived in Damascus and Egypt is Badr ad-Din Mahmud ibn Abdullah al-Gulistani al-Sarai al-Hanafi (d. 801/1399). After working as a judge in his country, he went to Baghdad and then to Damascus. He taught in madrasas such as Zahiriyah and Asadiyah. He went to Egypt during the reign of Sultan Berkuk and worked as a professor in Shayhuniyah and Sargatmushiyyah madrasas. Badr ad-Din Gulistani, who knew Arabic, Persian and Turkish languages very well, became the *katib al-sir* (personal secretary) of the Mamluk sultan for a period. In fiqh, he wrote a sharh for the work of Siraj ad-Din al-Sajawandi (after 596/1200), titled *al-Faraid al-Sirajiyah*. He wrote *Anisu al-Wahdat* and *Jalisu al-Halwa fi al-Muhadarat* in 'Ilm al-Insha' (art of writing letters) (Al-Maqrizi, 2002: 450-451; Katip Çelebi, 2016: 203).

Shafi'is

There were also Muslims of the Shafi'i madhab in Golden Horde territory. According to the writings of the historian Makrizi, the ambassadors returning from Sarai to Egypt in 725 Hijri (1325) brought with them a letter with gifts from the Golden Horde. In the letter, Uzbek Khan asked for books related to religion such as *Kitabu sharhu al-Sunnah*, *Jami'u al-Usul fi Ahadis ar-Rasul* and *ar-Rawiyani* to be sent to his country (Al-Maqrizi, 1997: 82). These books are considered to be among the most famous works belonging to the Shafi'i madhab of the period. It was likely necessary to bring such books from abroad to meet the legal needs of the local Shafi'its.

There is some information about the Shafi'is in the Golden Horde in Ibn Battuta's records. When the traveler was in the Solkhat city of the Golden Horde in the spring of 1333, one of the Shafi'is, Abu Bakr, was an imam in the mosque built by the Mamluk Sultan al-Malik al-Nasser. He also mentions the names of Shafi'i qadi Hidr and chief qadi Hanafi Shams ad-Din al-Saili among the most respected people of the city (Ibn Battuta, 1987: 330).

Ibn Battuta records that one of the 13 mosques in the Golden Horde capital of Sarai belonged to the Shafi'is, noting that "One of the best Shafi'i scholars of this city[...]is the imam faqih Sadr ad-Din Sulaiman al-Lakzi." (Ibn Battuta, 1987: 363-364).

Some famous Shafi'i faqihs of the period lived in the Golden Horde while they wrote their works. The most famous among them is Kutb ad-Din Muhammad ibn Muhammad al-Razi al-Shafi'i al-Tahtani (d.766/1365) and his student Sa'd ad-Din Mas'ud ibn Umar al-Taftazani (d. 792/1390). Taftazani was born in 1322 in Taftazan village near Nisa (Khorasan). Mentioned among his teachers is the great Shafi'i scholar Adud ad-Din al-Ijî (d. 756/1355). Taftazani lectured in various madrasas of Transoxiana for about thirty years. He lived in Herat and Gijduwan. Later, he came to work in Sarai at the invitation of Golden Orda Han Janibek. Al-Taftazani wrote his work *at-Talwih ala at-tawdih* in Gulistan in 753 Hijri/1352-1353 AD. He dedicated his *Muhtasar al-Ma'ani* to Janibek Khan (Marjani, 1897: 86-87). He wrote works on Shafi'i fiqh such as *Miftahu al-fiqh*.

There are different opinions about the madhab of al-Taftazani. In fact, al-Taftazani himself did not clearly declare his madhab in his works and wrote commentaries and hashiyas on both Shafi and Hanafi works. Lucknawi does not include al-Taftazani in his work on the biography of Hanafi scholars, but mentions him in the section where he writes about al-Jurjani, first recording the words of those who regarded him as Hanafi and then Shafi'i (Al-Lucknawi, 1324: 134-136). Shihab ad-Din Marjani, in the introduction of his hashiyahs written for *al-Talwih*, stated that al-Taftazani defended the views of Ash'ari and the Shafi'is, and noted that although he was an extreme madhab follower, he tried to hide his real views and explain the Hanafi method in their language. His main purpose, however, was to refute the evidence of the Hanafis, and he did so in *Sharh al-Aqaid* (Marjani, 1889: 3).

It should also be noted that although scholars often emphasized that they belonged to a specific madhab of Islam, they could not remain within the narrow framework of a single ideology alone. Most scholars understood that paying too much attention to minor differences would adversely affect the religion as a whole, so they placed emphasis on unifying aspects of the faith. The environment in which al-Taftazani was raised had a great influence on him, as did his teachers. An example of this kind of influence is one of al-Taftazani's teachers, Diya' ibn Said ibn Muhammad ibn Uthman al-Qirimi (d. 870/1379). Diya' al-Qirimi was a scholar of Tafsir, Arabic Language and Fiqh. His father was a qadi of Crimea. He received his primary education from his father and later learned from the scholars of that period such as al-Badr al-Tustari and al-Halhalali. Diya' al-Qirimi, who migrated from Crimea to

Cairo, taught at the Baibarsiyah and Shayhuniyah madrasas. Diya' al-Qirimi knew both the Hanafi and Shafi'i fiqh well and would say, "I am the Hanafi in methods and the Shafi'i in type" (Al-Dawudi, 1983: I/222-225).

Mahmud al-Saraii al-Bulgari al-Kardari, who lived in the second half of the 14th century, expressed his opinion in his works as the following: "Know and do that, if any mu'min or monotheist recognizes the oneness of Allah and Muhammad, the Messenger of Allah, as a true prophet, dies by loving the first four caliphs and the family (Ahl al-Bayt) of the Prophet (may the blessings and peace of Allah be upon him), and following one of the madhabs of the four Imams, his place will be Paradise," (Nahcü'l-Feradis, 1956: 228).

It is necessary to also mention some Shafi'i scholars who were raised in the Golden Horde but were later recognized in other countries. One of them was Husam ad-Din Abu Muhammad al-Hasan ibn Ramadan ibn al-Hasan al-Qirimi al-Shafi'i. His father, Muin ad-Din Abu al-Hasan al-Qirimi, was an imam and orator. He moved from Crimea to Safed and became one of the chief judges of the city, where he also built buildings. In 716 Hijri year, in the month of Dhu al-Qi'dah, he became the chief qadi (Muslim judge) of the city of Tripoli and carried out construction activities there. He moved to Egypt in 721 by the invitation of the Mamluk sultan. After staying in Egypt for some time, he went to Damascus. He died in Tripoli in 746 in the month of Rabi' al-Awwal (Al-Safadi, 1998: 194-195).

Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani briefly mentions another Shafi'i jurist from Harezm in his work. The scholar, Muhammad al-Khwarizmi, taught at the Tolun Mosque in Cairo. He recorded that the scholar died on 12 Rajab in 773 (January 19, 1372) (Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani, 1349: 318-319).

Another name found in tabakat books is the Shafi'i scholar of the Golden Horde, interpreter Hammam ibn Ahmed al-Khwarazmi. He taught *al-Hawi* and *al-Kashshâf* books as a *mudarris* (popular scholar) at the madrasas. He fell ill a few days after teaching tafsir until the 14th verse of Surah Saba' and passed away in 819/1416 at the age of 70 (Al-Dawudi, 1983: II/354).

Maturidis and Ash'aris

In the Golden Horde period, the Ahl al-Sunnah madhab was divided into two main branches: Maturidism and Ash'arism. Ash'arism became widespread in places like Khorasan, Iraq and Damascus, while Maturidism became widespread in Transoxi-

ana. There were some differences in opinions between these two branches on issues such as the inclusiveness of Allah's power and will, and the increase and decrease of faith and its exception. While Maturidis were generally Hanafi in that period, Ash'aris were in the Shafi'i madhab.

Al-Taftazani's *Sharh al-Aqaid* is one of the most important works written about the Ahl al-Sunnah in Golden Horde territory. Al-Taftazani completed his work in Khwarazm in 768/1367. It is very difficult to determine to what extent al-Taftazani defended the Ash'ari and Maturidi creeds in *Sharh al-Aqaid*. As a consequence, *Sharh al-Aqaid* is a creed book that combines both the Ash'ari and Maturidi creeds. In fact, Maturidis and Hanafis would later share common beliefs rooted in the content of *Sharh al-Aqaid*. The creation of a Maturidi community that thought and believed differently from Maturidi's main creeds was possible because of *Sharh al-Aqaid*. Therefore, we can say that al-Taftazani's purpose in writing this work was to reconcile the Ash'ari and Maturidi schools.

In addition, Sa'd ad-Din al-Taftazani was the first to use the term "Maturidiyah" together with the term "Ash'ariyah". Although he used the term "Faqih of Transoxiana" in *Sharh al-Aqaid*, he used the term "Maturidiyah" in another work, titled *Sharh al-Maqasid* (Al-Taftazani, 1998: 231). Sa'd ad-Din al-Taftazani stated that there were disagreements between these two schools on some issues, but none of the imams of either school accused the others of deviation or heresy. Compared to other groups, which did not hesitate to accuse each other of perversion even in some fiqh issues, the approach of these two madhabs towards each other was similar to the Sunnah of the Prophet Muhammad. Al-Taftazani's approach enabled the term "Mâturîdîyah" to gain legitimacy. His writings were constantly quoted, even by the Hanafits and Ash'arits who lived after him.

Al-Taftazani had many students and followers of Anatolian origin such as Burhan ad-Din Haydar, Ala ad-Din Rumi, Fath Allah Ajami and Molla Ferneri. Al-Taftazani's approach, which states that Ahl al-Sunnah consists of two groups (Ash'ariyah and Maturidiyah) without significant difference between them, was probably carried to Anatolia through his students. In the annotations of *Sharh al-Aqaid*, in the texts created in the late period in the context of the Asharism-Maturidism conflict, and in many other works, his statements in *Sharh al-Maqasid* were quoted or summarized exactly. This situation had a direct impact on the rise of the Ottomans, especially with the arrival of Fatih, so much so that he used the

term “Maturidiyah” instead of “Hanafits” in his treatise, similar to Ibn Kemalashazade Subki's *al-Qasîdatu al-Nuniyah*, in which he showed the conflicts between the two madhabs (Ibn Kemal Pashazade, 2008: 20-23). The term “Maturidiyah” which was introduced in the XIV century, has become a concept expressing the identity of those who are Hanafi in fiqh since the XV century.

Al-Taftazani wrote an annotation of Maturidi scholar al-Sadru al-Shari'a's (d.747 / 1347) fiqh method called *at-Tawdîh fî halli gawâmi'zi al-Tankih*. Al-Taftazani titled this work *at-Talwih fî Kashfi Haqâiki al-Tankih*. In this text, al-Taftazani criticizes the views of Sadru Sheri'a *on husn-qubh (good and evil)*. The debates between al-Sadru al-Shari'a and al-Taftazani formed the basis of a tradition in the later periods, and works that support one of the works while criticizing the other have been written. There are also scholars in the Golden Horde who wrote works on *Tawdih and Talwih*. For example, Sharaf ad-Din ibn Kamal ad-Din al-Qirimi (d. 1440) and Shihab ad-Din ibn 'Ata Allah al-Qirimi (d. 849/1445) wrote about this subject (Muminov, 2015: 228).

Although it is said that Sa'd ad-Din al-Taftazani was an Ash'ari-Shafi'i who hid his beliefs, we see that he also criticizes the Ash'aris in *Sharh al-Aqaid* like a scholar who is far from sectarian bigotry. For example, while accepting the attributes of sem' and basar of Allah, he does not hesitate to use the phrase "not as the Ash'aris claim" when describing the subject of sustenance. In short, when al-Taftazani's works are read carefully, it is clear that he opposes both Maturidism and Ash'arism when it comes to his place and time.

One of the most important representatives of the Maturidi tradition in the Arab countries during the Golden Horde period was Husam ad-Din Hussain ibn Ali ibn Hajjaj ibn Ali al-Sygnaki (d. 714/1314). He was born in the Golden Horde city of Sygnak, grew up in of the science centers, Khwarazm, and taught in cities such as Baghdad, Aleppo and Cairo. He wrote works in the form of commentary and copyright on the sciences of kalam, fiqh and nahw, and educated many students. On kalam, he transferred Abu al-Mu'in al-Nasafi's (d.508/1115) *at-Tamhid li qawâidi al-tawhid*, a commentary named *at-Tasdîd fî sharhi al-Tamhîd*, which was crucial in the survival of the text for subsequent generations. “I am not sure what this last sentence is saying. Is it something like “On the subject of Kalam”, – he wrote a commentary on Abu al-Mu'in al-Nasafi's (d.508/1115) *at-Tamhîd li qawâidi at-tawhid*

titled *at-Tasdîd fî sharhi al-Tamhîd*, *Dâmîğatu al-mubtadi'in* and *Nâsîratu al-muhtadin* also wrote works called *Sharhu Muhtasari al-Tahâwî* (Al-Tamimi, 1983: III/150-151; Al-Lucknawi, 1324: 62).

Another name found in the the biographical book of Taqi ad-Din al-Tamimi is that of Ishak ibn Ismail ibn Ibrahim ibn Shuayb ibn Muhammad ibn Idris al-Qirimi (d. H. 808), who was one of the students of Hafiz ad-Din al-Bazzazi from Khwarazm. Iskhâq al-Qirimi, who taught at the Qaitbai madrasah in Egypt, considered himself a member of the school of Abu Mansur al-Maturidi (Al-Tamimi, 1983: II/151-152).

Mu'tazilites

In the Golden Horde, apart from the Maturidi-Ash'ari theological madhabs, it is said that the Mu'tazila madhabs also existed. They generally lived in the Khwarazm. It is thought that the Mu'tazilites migrated from Iraq to the Khorasan and Khwarazm regions in the 12th century. Bartold writes that a person named Abu Mudar Mahmud al-Dabba al-Khwarizmi (d. 507/1113) first brought Mu'tazili ideas to Khwarazm from Isfahan (Bartold, 1963: 237). During this period, the majority of the population of Khwarazm belonged to the Hanafi madhabs. Only the people of Khiwa were in the Shafi'i madhab. The Shaf'is, however, were under the auspices of the government.

In the 12th century, a local school of thought that was Mu'tazili in creed and Hanafi in action emerged. Known as Fahr-i Khwarazm, Abu al-Qâsim Mahmud ibn Umar ibn Muhammad al-Khwarizmi az-Zamakhshari (d. 538/1144) was the most famous among its scholars. Zamakhshari was appreciated by both the Maturidis and the Mu'tazilites, due to his commentary titled *al-Kashshaf*.

The Mutazili-Hanafi tradition was later adopted by Muhammad ibn Abi al-Qasym al-Bakkali (d.576/1180-1181) and Nasr ibn Abi Said al-Mutarrizi (d.619/1219-1220), and was later continued by scholars such as Sadid ibn Muhammad al-Hayyati (7/13th century). Among the 13th-century Mu'tazili scholars, the name of Abu Ya'kub Siraj ad-Din Yusuf ibn Abi Bakr ibn Muhammed ibn Ali al-Khwarazmi al-Sakkaki (d. 626/1229) is the most prominent. Yusuf al-Sakkaki was a scholar who was an expert in theology, philosophy, philosophy of language, logic, fiqh, Arabic language, rhetoric, literature and poetry. Along with these sciences, it is recorded that he was famous in *al-'Ilmu al-Ladun* (secret teachings) such as astrology, incantation, horoscope, magic and alchemy. Learning of

al-Sakkaki's reputation in this field, Genghis Khan's son Chagatay Khan brought him to his palace as a courtesan and advisor. However, he was later imprisoned as a result of palace intrigue and state officials who were jealous of al-Sakkaki's reputation in the court. He died after having lived there for three years (Al-Lucknawi, 1324: 231-232).

Al-Zahidi was one of the supporters of Abu al-Hussain al-Basri (one of the Mu'tazilah scholars), and the imam of his followers (Ibn al-Wazir, 1984: 94). As a matter of fact, it is possible to see this in his works on kalām. In his works, Zahidi openly criticizes some of the views of *Ahl al-Sunnah* and defends the ideas of Mu'tazilah, whom he refers to as *Ahl al-'Adl wa al-Tawhid*. He also openly criticizes the views of Ahl al-Sunnah, who advocated that believers who commit major sins will come out of Hell after they are punished, that ru'yetullah will take place unconditionally and that power exists together with deed: even though one does not disbelieve, he will be counted among the people of whim and bid'ah (Al-Zahidi, 1830: 148). Adopting Mu'tazilah beliefs, al-Zahidi claimed that Prophet Isa was a strict Hanafi and the ummah would follow the Hanafi imam after his fall (Al-Zahidi, 1994: 69).

During the Mongol invasion, many jurists from Khwarazm were martyred. One of the students of Nasr ibn Abi Said al-Mutarrizi, al-Qasym ibn Hasan al-Khwarazmi 617/1220 was martyred by the Mongols during the siege of the city of Jurjaniyah. Al-Zahidi mentioned a number of his teachers Badi' ibn Abi Mansur and Yusuf ibn Muhammad al-Hafsi as "the master of the martyrs (shahids)". After the war was over, al-Hafsi's student Muhammad ibn Mahmud al-Khwarizmi (d. 655/1257) became a qadi and imam during the Mongolian period (Muminov, 2015: 20).

One of the latest Mu'tazilah scholars of the Golden Horde was Nu'man ad-Din Abd al-Jabbar ibn Abdallah al-Mu'tazili al-Hanafi al-Khwarizmi (770-805/1368-1402). Nu'man ad-Din al-Khwarizmi went to Amir Timur and became his highly respected scholar. It is known that he was a person who knows sciences such as Fiqh, Usul al-Fiqh, Maani, Bayan, Arabic Language very well. He had achieved leadership among Timur's servants. His power and authority was immense. When Timur came to Aleppo and Damascus, he brought the scholar with him. He participated in discussions with scholars there. He spoke Arabic, Persian and Turkish very fluently. He had a wealth of wealth, prestige, and was highly respected. Besides Timur, he has often benefited Muslims. Because the Mus-

lims were in a difficult situation in the conversation of Timur and they had no choice but to agree with his opinion (Ibn Al-Imad, 1992: 79; Al-Lucknawi, 1324: 129-130).

In the references it is mentioned that Numan ad-Din al-Khwarizmi became a judge in Timur's palace in a debate between Ali ibn Muhammed ibn Ali Sayyid Sharif al-Jurjani (740-816/1340-1413) and Sa'd ad-Din al-Taftazani in Shiraz. The subject of the debate was whether the metaphor in the 5th verse of Surah al-Baqarah. In this debate, Numan ad-Din Khwarizmi found al-Jurjani justified (Al-Lucknawi, 1324: 128-129).

Results and discussion

There were full of tense relations between Hanafi-Mu'tazilites and Hanafi-Maturidis, who had gained great power in Khwarazm at the end of the XII and the beginning of the XIII century. Actually, the jurist Umar ibn Ahmad al-Kahushtuwani (d. 673/1274 in Jurjaniyah) wanted to leave Khwarazm before he died in order not to be buried together with the Mu'tazilites (Muminov, 2015: 205). In his work al-Bazzâzi, in a quote from one of the Imams from Harezm of that period, he states that girls can be taken from Mu'tazilah but they cannot be given them, and at this point, he explains that they treated the Mu'tazilah like the People of *Ahl al-Kitab* (Jews, Christians, and Zoroastrians) (Al-Bazzazi, 1971: 102).

However, in the Golden Horde, there was no pressure from the political authority against the Mu'tazilites in the early periods. Al-Zahid from Khwarazm, one of the Mu'tazilah scholars, dedicated his work *al-Risalat al-Nasriyah* to Berke Khan, the ruler of the Golden Horde, in the last period of his life. He welcomed the efforts of Berke Khan to spread Islam in his country with great appreciation and enthusiasm, and wrote eulogies to Berke Khan, whom he saw as a great savior (Al-Zahidi, 1994: 27).

However, later on, the Maturidi-Hanafis were strengthened in Khwarazm with the support of the Golden Horde Khans. As a matter of fact, Ibn Battuta, who came to Khwarazm in 1333, among the notables of his city (including the teacher of the governor of the city), stated: "most of them Ahl al-Itizal, but they do not show it to others. Because Sultan Uzbek and his governor in the city, Qutlug Timur, are from Ahl al-Sunnah" (Ibn Battuta, 1987: 367). This means that during the period of Uzbek Khan, Mu'tazilah lost its former power and the few

remaining followers had to hide their creeds. In the later periods, there is no information about the Mu'tazilites of Khwarazm in historical works. The Mu'tazilites, who were probably few in number, disappeared among the Hanafi majority after the Timurid period.

However, the madhabic debates in the Golden Horde were not only limited to the Maturidi and Mu'tazilah conflicts, but also continued between the Asharis and the Maturidis. Sometimes it is seen that madhabic bigotry is included too.

Hanafi faqih al-Bazzazi (d.827/1424) states that it is not permissible to marry Shafi'its who have different views from Hanafits on issues such as exceptions in faith (iman), just like in relations with Mu'tazilah (Al-Bazzazi, 1971: 101-102). Hanafi faqih al-Bazzazi (d.827/1424) states that it is not permissible to marry Shafiits who have different views from Hanafits on issues such as exceptions in faith, just like in relations with Mu'tazila. In his work, al-Bazzazi includes a quote from Imam al-Safkardarî: "It is not appropriate for someone from the Hanafi madhab to give a girl to a Shafi'i, but a girl can be taken from him." In addition, it is mentioned that al-Bazzazi even did not allow cutting a sheep to a person who says, "I am a Muslim God willing" (*Ana Muslim In shaa Allah*) (Al-Bazzazi, 1971: 439). Then, he lists those who are disbelievers according to Imam az-Zahid al-Saffar and talks about their creeds that are considered contrary to the creed of Ahl al-Sunnah. Qadariyah, Kay-saniyah, Rafidiyah, Harriyah, Ezidiyah, Najjariyah, Karramiyah, Mushabbiha madhabs were accused of kufr (disbelief), and he considers some groups of the Mu'tazilah as mu'tadi and others as infidel. He mentions that those of the Shia creed who denied the caliphate of Abu Bakr and Omar were also called infidels (Al-Bazzazi, 1971: 439-440).

It is seen that the problem of "exception in faith", which is the subject of discussion between the Ash'aris and the Maturidis, was first discussed at the end of the 1st century A.H. and the beginning of the 2nd century. However, there is no definite separation in this period. But, among Muslims, the first division in this area emerged on issues such as the definition of faith, the exception in faith, the distinction between faith and deeds, and equality in faith.

In the 2nd century AH, Abu Hanifa and his friends were at the forefront of those who rejected the exception in faith, and Sufyan al-Thawri and his followers were at the forefront of those who supported this view. In Abu Hanifa *al-Wasiyah* says "A believer is a true believer and an unbeliever is a true

unbeliever (Abu Hanifa, 1997: 30-31). According to Abu Hanifa, exception in this belief indicates doubt. Therefore, it is not permissible to doubt in faith.

According to al-Maturidi, who adopted this basic approach of Abu Hanifa, it is not permissible to make exceptions in faith. Because exceptions are possible only in matters that are met with suspicion and suspicion. In faith, however, it is not possible to talk about such a thing. For, a belief that mixes speculation and doubt ceases to be a true belief (Al-Maturidi, 1979: 388-392).

The basis of these long-standing debates between Ash'aris and Maturidis is the difference in understandings of the relationship between deeds-faith and faith-Islam, and in their understanding of destiny. Maturidis are of the opinion that exceptions cannot be made because the word faith expresses certainty in religion, while Ash'arites are of the opinion that exceptions will be possible regarding the perfection and outcome of faith, not the truth. It is intended to convey the message that one should not be sure of his fate in a wide variety of debates, that a person who thinks he is a believer can be an unbeliever in the sight of Allah, and that a person who is called an unbeliever can actually be a believer in the sight of Allah.

However, al-Taftazani, who aims to reconcile by emphasizing the common points between the two schools, says the following on this subject: "The truth is this: Because if faith and happiness mean the product of the abstract meaning, that meaning already exists right now. If the phrase faith and bliss is meant to mean the salvation and the fruits of those things, it is also in the will and will of Allah. Its occurrence cannot be predicted at this time. Those who express absolutely that there is faith and happiness at this time mean the first meaning and the way of explanation. Those who refer the matter to the will and authority of Allah in this regard mean the second meaning and the way of explanation" (Al-Taftazani, 2017: 232). Therefore, al-Taftazani argues that some of the controversial issues between Maturidis and Ash'aris are verbal and formal, and there is no significant difference when the issue is deepened.

At the same time, al-Taftazani criticizes the ulama who took a harsh, rigid and intolerant attitude towards non-Sunni madhabs in *Sharh al-Aqaid*. While dealing with the creation of human action, he says: "The ulama of Ma Wara' an-Nahr went too far in accusing the Mu'tazilah of heresy" (Al-Taftazani, 2017: 160).

Al-Taftazani is rightly disturbed by the harsh and strict attitude of the Ma Wara' an-Nahr (Tran-

soxiana) scholars, namely the Maturidis, towards the Mu'tazilah. At this point, he defends the Mu'tazilah against the Maturidis. However, he does not object by quoting the words of al-Karhi, who says "I am afraid that those who do not consider mash to be permissible on mest, to become unbelievers" and refers to the Jafariyah (a Shiite fiqh madhab) in another place, and he does not object, and he is as harsh and harsh as the scholars of Transoxiana, who accuse the Shi'a and the Mu'tazilah on some issues rigidly. In addition, while arguing that nabis is not haram, opposing the "Rafidis" who say the opposite is a principle in Sunnism, thus accusing the Ja'farids of being Rafidis (Al-Taftazani, 2017: 275). In the meantime, we can say that the reason for al-Taftazani's behavior towards the Mu'tazila was to prevent sectarian conflicts and to protect the social order, even though he criticized the Shiite groups that could not hold on in the Golden Horde.

Conclusion

Hanafism was a widespread madhab accepted by the majority of the Muslims of the Golden Horde. In this period, annotations were made on the works written in the field of Hanafi fiqh, notes were added, summaries were created or some works were written by rearranging. Therefore we can clearly say that Hanafism, as the majority Muslim madhab, developed singularly in the Golden Horde and possessed its own traditions. Along with the influence of scientific centers such as Bukhara and Samarkand in Transoxiana, old Hanafi science centers in the country such as Khwarazm and Bulgar were also greatly influential. In addition, Hanafits from the Golden Horde were known for their scientific activities not only in their country, but also abroad.

The number of Muslims belonging to the Shafi'i madhab in the Golden Horde was fewer than the Hanafits. As a matter of fact, since they did not have their own religious center in the country, they had to bring religious works belonging to the Shafi'i madhab abroad. However, it is possible to come across the names of Shafi'i scholars from Crimea and Khwarazm, who were known outside the Golden

Horde in later periods, in the strata books. In addition, Shafi'i scholars took the first step in reconciling the fiqh sects in the creed of Ahl al-Sunnah in the Golden Horde. Although the most educated scholars of the period often emphasized to which madhab of Islam they belonged, they could not stay within the narrow framework of just one ideology. They understood that drawing too much attention to minor differences would negatively affect the religion as a whole, so they placed emphasis on the unifying aspects of the religion.

We see that the Mu'tazilites, who migrated from Iraq to the Khorasan and Khwarazm regions in the 12th century, preserved their existence in the Golden Horde as well. However, since they generally lived in the Khwarazm region, they remained a local sect and could not spread throughout the vast Golden Horde geography. In addition, we see that they experienced both political and social pressure during the Uzbek Khan period.

Continuing from ancient times between Maturidi-Hanafis and Ashari-Shafi'is, religious debates could adversely affect the situation in the Golden Horde politically and socially. However, it is possible to see that the scholars in the Golden Horde lands tried to reconcile the Muslim madhabs in the area with support of the state. For this reason, Janibek Khan invited al-Taftazani, who evaluated Ash'ari and Maturidi schools within the framework of Ahl al-Sunnah, to the Golden Horde. Al-Taftazani first presented Maturidism as one of the two main branches of Ahl al-Sunnah (alongside Ash'arism), which reflects a new way of viewing of the Ash'ari-Maturidi relationship.

Al-Taftazani not only stayed with the Ahl al-Sunnah, but also criticized the strict attitude of Hanafi faqihs from Transoxiana to the Mu'tazilites, and called them to give more importance to common values. After developing for some time in the Golden Horde, it is possible to see the Hanafi-Maturidi tradition gaining absolute superiority in Ahl al-Sunnah. However, the developments in the Ash'ari-Maturidi relations took place outside the Golden Horde, that is in the Ottoman Empire. We can say that this is possible due to the Hanafi-Shafi'i scholars who carried al-Taftazani's thoughts to Anatolia.

Әдебиеттер

- Abu Hanifa al-Nu'man (1997) *Wasiyat al-Imam Abi Hanifa an-Nu'man*, ed. Abu Mu'az Muhammad ibn Abdilhay Uweyna, Beirut: Daru ibn Hazm. – p. 81.
- Al-Bazzazi, Muhammad ibn Muhammad (1971) *Al-Fatawa al-Bazzâziyah*, Vol. I, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyah. – p. 608.
- Al-Dawudi, Muhammad ibn Ali (1983) *Tabakat al-Mufassirin*, Vol. I-II, Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah. – p. 884.
- Al-Lucknawi, Muhammad Abd al-Hayy (H. 1324) *Fawâidu al-bahiyah fî tarâjimi al-Hanafiyah*, Cairo: Al-Saadat. – p. 262.
- Al-Maqrizi, Ahmad ibn Ali (1997) *Al-Suluk li-Ma'rifat Duwali al-Muluk*, ed. Muhammad Abdulqadir Ato, Vol. III, Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah. – p. 432.
- Al-Maqrizi, Ahmad ibn Ali (2002) *Duraru al-'ukudi al-Farida fî tarâjimi al-a'yâni al-mufida*, ed. Mahmud al-Jalili, Vol. III. Beirut: Daru al-Garbi al-Islami. – p. 586.
- Al-Maturidi, Abu Mansur Muhammad (1979) *Kitab al-Tawhid*, ed. Fethullah Huleyf, İstanbul: el-Mektebetü'l- İslâmiyye. – p. 411.
- Al-Safadi, Khalil ibn Aibak (1998) *A'yân al-'asr wa a'vânu an-nasr*, Vol.II, Damascus: Dar al-Fikr. – p. 512.
- Al-Taftazani, Sa'd ad-Dîn Mas'ud ibn 'Umar (2017) *Şerhu'l-Akâid (Kelâm ilmi ve İslâm akâidi)*, ed. Süleyman Uludağ, İstanbul: Dergah yayınları. – p. 398.
- Al-Taftazani, Sa'd ad-Dîn Mas'ud ibn 'Umar (1998) *Sharh al-Mağâsid*, ed. A.Umeyre-S. M. Sharaf, Beirut: Alam al-Kutub. – p. 269.
- Al-Tamimi, Taqi ad-Din (1983) *Tabaqat as-Saniyah fî Tarajimi al-Hanafiyah*, ed. Abd al-Fattah Muhammad Hulw, Vol. II-III, Riyadh: Dâru al-Rifâi. – I/438, II/316, III/291.
- Al-Zahidi, Mukhtar ibn Mahmud (1830) *Kunyetu al-Munyah li-tatmimi al-Gunyah*, Kolkata: Mehanand. – p. 397.
- Al-Zahidi, Mukhtar ibn Mahmud (1994) *Risalat al-Nasriyah*, ed. Muhammad al-Mirsi, Kuwait: Markaz al-Makhtutat wa al-Turathi wa al-Wathaiq. – p. 82.
- Ibn al-Imad (1992) *Shadharat al-dhahab*, V.IX, ed. Mahmud al-Arnaut, Beirut: Dar al-Kathir. – p. 451.
- Ibn al-Wazir (1984) *Tarjihu asâlibi al-Quran'alâ asâlibi al-Yûnân*, Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah. – p. 176.
- Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani (H.1349) *Ad-Duraru al-kamina fî a'yâni al-mi'eti as-sâmina*, Vol. IV, Hyderabad: Dairat al-Maarifi al-Usmaniyah. – p. 505.
- Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani (1969), *Inbâ'u al-gumr bi-abnâ'i al-Umr*, ed. Hasan Habashi, Vol. I, Cairo. – p. 552.
- Ibn Kemal Pashazade, Shamsuddin Ahmed ibn Sulaiman (2008) “*Risalat al-Ihtilaf baina al-Ashâ'ira wa al-Maturidiyah*”, *Sunnitishce Theologie in Osmanischer Zeit*, ed. E. Badeen, Würzburg: Ergon Verlag. – p. 352.
- Ibn Battuta (1987) *Rihlatu Ibn Battuta (Tuhfatu al-Nuzzar fî Gara'ibi al-Amsar wa al-'Acâ'ibi al-Asfar)*, ed. Muhammad Abdulmunin al-Uryan, Beirut: Daru al-Ihiya al-Ulum. – p. 798.
- Katip Çelebi (2016) *Keşfü'z-Zunun Al Esami'l-Kütübi ve'l-Fünûn*, trans. Rüştü Balcı, Vol. IV, İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları. – p. 1650.
- Marjani, Shihabuddin. (1889) *Kitabu al-haqq al-mubin fi makhasin awda ad-din*. Kazan: Çirkov. – p. 462.
- Marjani, Shihabuddin. (1897) *Kitabu Mustafâd al-akhbar fi Ahwâli Kazan ve Bulgar*, V.I, Kazan: Tipografya B.L.Dombrovskago. – 264.
- Nahcü'l-Feradis (1956) ed. János Eckmann, Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu Tıpkıbasımlar Dizisi 35. – p. 444.
- Ramzi, Murad (2002). *Talfiq al-Akhbar wa talkih al-Asar fî waka'i'i Kazan wa Bulgar wa muluki al-Tatar*, V. I, Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah. – p. 736.
- Ал-Карши, Джамал (2005) *ал-Мулхакат би-с-сурах / пер. Ш. Х. Вохидова, Б. Б. Аминова*. Алматы: Дайк-Пресс. – p. 416.
- Бартолд В. В. (1963) *Сочинения. Т. II. Часть I. Общие работы по истории Средней Азии. Работы по истории Кавказа и Восточной Европы*. – М.: Издательство восточной литературы. – 1024 с.
- Муминов, А. (2015) *Ханафитский мазхаб в истории Центральной Азии*. – Алматы: Қазақ энциклопедиясы. – 400 с.

References

- Abu Hanifa al-Nu'mān (1997) *Wasiyat al-Imam Abi Hanifa al-Nu'mān [The Bequeathment of al-Imam Abu Hanifa al-Nu'mān]*, ed. Abu Mu'az Muhammad ibn Abdilhay Uweyna. Beirut: Daru ibn Hazm. – p. 81 (in Arabic)
- Al-Bazzazi, Muhammad ibn Muhammad (1971) *Al-Fatawa al-Bazzâziyah [Al-Bazzazi's Fatwas]*, Vol. I. Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah. – p. 608. (in Arabic).
- Al-Dawudi, Muhammad ibn Ali (1983) *Tabakat al-Mufassirin [Layers of Interpreters]*, Vol.I-II. Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah. – 884. (in Arabic)
- Al-Lucknawi, Abd al-Hayy (H. 1324) *Fawâidu al-bahiyah fî tarâjimi al-Hanafiyah [Radiant Benefits of the Biographies of the Hanafis]*, Cairo: Al-Saadat. – p. 262. (in Arabic)
- Al-Maqrizi, Ahmad ibn Ali (1997) *Kitab al-Suluk li-Ma'rifat Duwal al-Mulūk [Book of Entrance to the knowledge of the dynasties of the Kings]*, ed. Muhammad Abd al-Qadir Ato, Vol. III. Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah. – 432. (in Arabic)
- Al-Maqrizi, Ahmad ibn Ali (2002) *Durar al-Uqud al-Faridah fi Tarajim al-A'yan al-Mufidah, [Pearls of an Inimitable Necklace in the Biographies of Prominent Personalities]*, ed. Mahmud al-Jalili, Vol. III. Beirut: Daru al-Garbi al-Islami. – p. 586. (in Arabic)
- Al-Maturidi, Abu Mansur Muhammad (1979) *Kitab al-Tawhid [Book of Monotheism]*, ed. Fethullah Huleyf. İstanbul: – p. 411. (in Arabic)

- Al-Qarshi, Jamal (2005) *Al-Mulhaqat bi-s-Surah* [Addition to as-Surakh vocabulary], trans. Sh. B. Vokhidov, B. B. Aminov. – Almaty: Dayk-press. – p. 416. (in Arabic/Russian)
- Al-Safadi, Khalil ibn Aybak (1998) *A'yân al-'asr wa a'vânu an-nasr* [Notables of the era and helpers of victory], Vol.II. – Damascus: Dar al-Fikr. – p. 512. (in Arabic)
- Al-Taftazani, Sa'd ad-Dîn Mas'ud ibn Umar (2017) *Sharh al-Aqaid* (Kelâm ilmi ve İslâm akâidi) [The commentary on the al-Aqaid (Teachings of Kalam and Islamic creed)], ed. Süleyman Uludağ. – İstanbul: Dergah yay. – p. 398 (in Turkish)
- Al-Taftazani, Sa'd ad-Dîn Mas'ud ibn Umar (1998) *Sharh al-Maqasid* [The commentary on the al-Maqasid], ed. S. M. Sharaf. – Beirut: – p. 269 (in Arabic)
- Al-Tamimi, Taqi ad-Din (1983) *Tabaqat al-Saniyah fi Tarajimi al-Hanafiyah* [Layers in the Hanafi biographies], ed. Abd al-Fattah Muhammad Hulw, Vol.I-III, Riyadh: Dâru al-Rifai. – I/438, II/316, III/291. (in Arabic)
- Al-Zahidi, Mukhtar ibn Mahmud (1830) *Qunyat al-munya li tatmim al-ghunya* [Possession of dreamt for the complete prosperity]. – Kolkata: Mehanand. – p. 397. (in Arabic)
- Al-Zahidi, Mukhtar ibn Mahmud (1994) *Risalat al-Nasiriyah* [The epistle of victory], ed. Muhammad al-Misri. – Kuwait: Markaz al-Makhtutat wa al-Turathi wa al-Wathaiq. – p. 82. (in Arabic)
- Bartold V. V. (1963) *Obshhie raboty po istorii Srednej Azii. Raboty po istorii Kavkaza i Vostochnoj Evropy* [General works on the history of Central Asia. Works on the history of the Caucasus and Eastern Europe] *Sochineniya* : v 9 t.– V. II, part. 1. – Moscow: Izdatelstvo vostochnoj literatury. – p. 1024. (in Russian)
- Ibn Al-Imad, Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-'Aqri al-Hanbali al-Dimashqi (1992) *Shazarat al-zahab fi ahbari man zahab*, Vol.IX [Grains of Gold in the Notice of Those Who Have Gone], ed. Mahmud al-Arnaut. – Beirut: Dar al-Kathir. – p. 451. (in Arabic)
- Ibn al-Wazir (1984) *Tarjihu asâlîbi al-Quran'alâ asâlîbi al-Yûnân* [Preferring the styles of the Qur'an over the styles of Greece]. – Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah. – p. 176. (in Arabic)
- Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani (H.1349) *ad-Duraru al-kamina fi a'yâni al-mi'eti al-sâmina* [The Hidden Pearls Concerning the Famous People of the Eighth Century AH], Vol.IV. – Hyderabad: Dairat al-Maarifi al-USmaniyyah. – 505. (in Arabic)
- Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani (1969) *Inbâ'u al-gumr bi-abnâ'i al-Umr* [Notification of the Unreasonable about the Children of the Century], ed. Hasan Habashi, Vol.I. – Cairo. – p. 552. (in Arabic)
- Ibn Kemal Pashazade, Shams ad-Din Ahmad ibn Sulaiman. (2008) “*Risalat al-Ihtilaf bain al-Ashâ'ira wa al-Maturidiyah*”, [A treatise pertaining to the differences between the Ash'aris and Maturidis] *Sunnitishce Theologie in Osmanischer Zeit*, ed. E. Badeen. – Würzburg. – p. 352. (in Arabic and German Edition)
- Ibn Battuta (1987) *Rihlatu Ibn Battuta (Tuhfatu al-Nuzzar fi Gara'ibi al-Amsar wa al-'Acâ'ibi al-Asfar)* [The Rihla, or A Masterpiece to Those Who Contemplate the Wonders of Cities and the Marvels of Travelling] ed. Muhammad Abd al-Mumin al-Uryan. – Beirut: Daru al-Ihiya al-Ulum. – p. 798. (in Arabic)
- Katip Çelebi (2016) *Keşfü'z-zunûn 'an esâmi'l-kütüb ve'l-fünûn* [The Removal of Doubt from the Names of Books and the Arts], trans. Rüştü Balcı. Vol.IV. – Istanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları. – p. 1650. (in Turkish)
- Marjani, Shihabuddin (1889) *Kitabu al-haqq al-mubin fi makhasin awda ad-din* [The Obvious Truth About the Merits of the Prescriptions of Islam]. – Kazan: Çirkov. – p. 462. (in Arabic)
- Marjani, Shihabuddin (1897) *Kitabu Mustafâd al-akhbar fi Ahwâli Kazan ve Bulgar* [A treasure trove of information about the affairs of Kazan and Bulgar], Vol.I. – Kazan: Tipografya B.L.Dombrovskago. – p. 264.(in Tatarian).
- Muminov, A. (2015) *Hanafitskiy mazhab v istorii Tsenralnoy Azii* [Hanafi madhhab in the history of Central Asia]. – Almaty: Kazak Entsiklopediyasy. – p. 400. (in Russian)
- Nahcü'l-Feradis. (1956) [Open road to Paradise] ed. János Eckmann. – Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu Tıpkıbasımlar Dizisi 35. – p. 444. (in Arabic)
- Ramzi, Murad (2002) *Talfiq al-Akhbar wa talkih al-Asar fi waka'i'i Kazan wa Bulgar wa muluki al-Tatar* [An Imperfect Collection of Information From The Past Events of Kazan, Bulgar and Tatar Kings], V. I. – Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah. – p. 736. (in Arabic)